



**NEITHER  $\prod_{k=1}^n (4k^2 + 1)$  NOR  $\prod_{k=1}^n (2k(k-1) + 1)$  IS A PERFECT SQUARE**

**Jin-Hui Fang**<sup>1</sup>

*Department of Mathematics, Nanjing Normal University, Nanjing 210097, P. R. China*

fangjinhui1114@163.com

*Received: 8/8/08, Revised: 2/12/09, Accepted: 3/2/09*

**Abstract**

In this paper, by employing Cilleruelo's method, we prove that neither  $\prod_{k=1}^n (4k^2 + 1)$  nor  $\prod_{k=1}^n (2k(k-1) + 1)$  is a perfect square for all  $n > 1$ , which confirms a conjecture of Amdeberhan, Medina, and Moll.

**1. Introduction**

Recently, there has been a renewed interest in investigating whether or not certain product sequences contain perfect squares. Amdeberhan, Medina and Moll [1] proposed several conjectures in this direction. Soon after, J. Cilleruelo [2] proved that the number

$$\prod_{k=1}^n (k^2 + 1)$$

is not a perfect square provided  $n > 3$ , which settles Conjecture 5.1 in [1]. Amdeberhan, Medina and Moll [1] also proposed the following conjecture.

**Conjecture 1 ([1, Conjecture 7.1]).** *The even and odd parts of  $\prod_{k=1}^n (k^2 + 1)$  are defined by*

$$t_n := \prod_{k=1}^n (1 + 2k(k-1)), \text{ and } s_n := \prod_{k=1}^n (1 + 4k^2).$$

*These products involve the triangular and square numbers respectively. Neither of them is a perfect square.*

In this paper, by employing Cilleruelo's method, we confirm this conjecture.

**Theorem 2.** *Neither  $\prod_{k=1}^n (4k^2 + 1)$  nor  $\prod_{k=1}^n (2k(k-1) + 1)$  is a perfect square for all  $n > 1$ .*

---

<sup>1</sup>Supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China, Grant No.10771103 and the Outstanding Graduate Dissertation program of Nanjing Normal University No.181200000213.

**2. Proof of Theorem 2**

*Proof.* In this paper,  $p$  always denotes a rational prime.

Let  $P_n = \prod_{k=1}^n (4k^2 + 1)$ . Assume that  $P_n$  is a perfect square for some  $n > 1$ . Let  $p$  be a prime with  $p|P_n$ . Then  $p^2|P_n$  and  $p \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ . If there exists a positive integer  $k \leq n$  with  $p^2|4k^2 + 1$ , then  $p \leq \sqrt{4n^2 + 1} < 2n + 1$ . Thus  $p < 2n$ . If there exist  $i, j, 1 \leq i < j \leq n$  with  $p|4i^2 + 1$  and  $p|4j^2 + 1$ , then  $p|4(j - i)(j + i)$ . Thus either  $p|j - i$  or  $p|j + i$ . So  $p \leq j + i < 2n$ .

Hence

$$P_n = \prod_{\substack{p < 2n \\ p \equiv 1 \pmod{4}}} p^{\alpha_p}.$$

Let  $n! = \prod_{p \leq n} p^{\beta_p}$ . Since  $4^n n!^2 < P_n$ , we have

$$\sum_{p \leq n} \beta_p \log p < \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{p < 2n \\ p \equiv 1 \pmod{4}}} \alpha_p \log p - n \log 2. \tag{1}$$

Since each interval of length  $p^j$  contains at most two solutions of  $4x^2 + 1 \equiv 0 \pmod{p^j}$ , we have

$$\alpha_p = \sum_{j \leq \log(4n^2+1)/\log p} \#\{k \leq n : p^j|4k^2 + 1\} \leq \sum_{j \leq \log(4n^2+1)/\log p} 2\lceil n/p^j \rceil. \tag{2}$$

On the other hand

$$\beta_p = \sum_{j \leq \log n/\log p} \#\{k \leq n : p^j|k\} = \sum_{j \leq \log n/\log p} \lfloor n/p^j \rfloor. \tag{3}$$

Thus we have

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_p/2 - \beta_p &\leq \sum_{j \leq \log(4n^2+1)/\log p} \lceil n/p^j \rceil - \sum_{j \leq \log n/\log p} \lfloor n/p^j \rfloor \\ &= \sum_{j \leq \log n/\log p} (\lceil n/p^j \rceil - \lfloor n/p^j \rfloor) + \sum_{\log n/\log p < j \leq \log(4n^2+1)/\log p} \lceil n/p^j \rceil \\ &\leq \frac{\log(4n^2 + 1)}{\log p}. \end{aligned} \tag{4}$$

By (1) and (4) we have

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{\substack{p \leq n \\ p \not\equiv 1 \pmod{4}}} \beta_p \log p &= \sum_{p \leq n} \beta_p \log p - \sum_{\substack{p \leq n \\ p \equiv 1 \pmod{4}}} \beta_p \log p \\ &\leq \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n < p < 2n} \alpha_p \log p - n \log 2 + \log(4n^2 + 1)\pi(n; 1, 4), \end{aligned} \tag{5}$$

where  $\pi(n; 1, 4)$  denotes the number of primes which are less than or equal to  $n$  and congruent to 1 modulo 4.

If  $p > n$ , then

$$\frac{\log(4n^2 + 1)}{\log p} < \frac{\log(n + 1)^3}{\log(n + 1)} = 3.$$

By (2) we have  $\alpha_p \leq 4$ .

If  $p \leq n$ , then by (3) we have

$$\begin{aligned} \beta_p &\geq \sum_{j \leq \log n / \log p} \left( \frac{n}{p^j} - 1 \right) = n \left( \frac{1 - p^{-1 - \lfloor \log n / \log p \rfloor}}{1 - 1/p} - 1 \right) - \lfloor \log n / \log p \rfloor \\ &\geq n \left( \frac{1 - 1/n}{1 - 1/p} - 1 \right) - \lfloor \log n / \log p \rfloor = \frac{n - p}{p - 1} - \lfloor \log n / \log p \rfloor \\ &\geq \frac{n - 1}{p - 1} - \frac{\log(4n^2 + 1)}{\log p}, \end{aligned}$$

where the last inequality is based on the fact  $p \leq n$ .

Thus, by (5) we have

$$(n - 1) \sum_{\substack{p \leq n \\ p \neq 1 \pmod{4}}} \frac{\log p}{p - 1} < \log(4n^2 + 1)\pi(n) + 2 \sum_{n < p < 2n} \log p - n \log 2,$$

where  $\pi(n)$  denotes the number of primes which are less than or equal to  $n$ .

Now we use the Chebyshev's estimates

$$\sum_{p \leq n} \log p \leq 2n \log 2, \quad \sum_{n < p < 2n} \log p \leq 2n \log 2$$

and (see [3])

$$\pi(x) \leq \frac{x}{\log x} \left( 1 + \frac{1.2762}{\log x} \right) \quad (x > 1)$$

to obtain

$$\sum_{\substack{p \leq n \\ p \neq 1 \pmod{4}}} \frac{\log p}{p - 1} < \frac{\log(4n^2 + 1)}{n - 1} \left( \frac{n}{\log n} + \frac{1.2762n}{\log^2 n} \right) + \frac{3n}{n - 1} \log 2.$$

We know that the right-hand side is monotonic decreasing. Actually, that quantity is less than 7.14 for  $n \geq 702007$ .

For  $n \geq 702007$ , we have

$$\sum_{\substack{p \leq n \\ p \neq 1 \pmod{4}}} \frac{\log p}{p - 1} \geq \sum_{\substack{p \leq 702007 \\ p \neq 1 \pmod{4}}} \frac{\log p}{p - 1} > 7.14,$$

which proves the theorem for  $n \geq 702007$ .

Finally we have to check that  $P_n$  is not a square for  $2 \leq n < 702007$ .

- $17 = 4 \times 2^2 + 1$ . The next time that the prime 17 divides  $4k^2 + 1$  is for  $k = 17 - 2 = 15$ . Hence  $P_n$  is not a square for  $2 \leq n \leq 14$ .
- $101 = 4 \times 5^2 + 1$ . The next time that the prime 101 divides  $4k^2 + 1$  is for  $k = 101 - 5 = 96$ . Hence  $P_n$  is not a square for  $5 \leq n \leq 95$ .
- $1297 = 4 \times 18^2 + 1$ . The next time that the prime 1297 divides  $4k^2 + 1$  is for  $k = 1297 - 18 = 1279$ . Hence  $P_n$  is not a square for  $18 \leq n \leq 1278$ .
- $739601 = 4 \times 430^2 + 1$ . The next time that the prime 739601 divides  $4k^2 + 1$  is for  $k = 739601 - 430 = 739171$ . Hence  $P_n$  is not a square for  $430 \leq n \leq 739170$ .

Therefore  $\prod_{k=1}^n (4k^2 + 1)$  is not a perfect square. The proof that  $\prod_{k=1}^n (2k(k - 1) + 1)$  is not a perfect square is completely similar. This completes the proof of Theorem 2.  $\square$

**Acknowledgements** I sincerely thank my supervisor Professor Yong-Gao Chen for his valuable suggestions and useful discussions. I am also grateful to the referee for his/her valuable comments.

## References

- [1] T.Amdeberhan, L.A.Medina, and V.H.Moll, Arithmetical properties of a sequence arising from an arctangent sum, *J. Number Theory* **128**(6) (2008), 1807-1846.
- [2] J. Cilleruelo, Square in  $(1^2 + 1) \cdots (n^2 + 1)$ , *J. Number Theory* **128**(8) (2008), 2488-2491.
- [3] P.Dusart, The  $k$ th prime is greater than  $k(\ln k + \ln \ln k - 1)$  for  $k \geq 2$ , *Math.Comp.* **68** (1999), 411-415.